The MPLS-TP Requirements document, draft-ietf-mpls-tp-requirements-06, has been reviewed by the experts of SG 15. A significant number of both technical and editorial issues have been identified. A marked up version of the draft including these comments is attached. We note that the editors and experts from the ITU are currently working to develop text to address these points.

Points that have caused significant discussion are:

a) The proposal to remove the definition of tandem connection:

b) Support for AIS/FDI

c) Requirement 32: “MPLS-TP MUST support unidirectional, co-routed bidirectional and associated bidirectional point-to-point transport paths.”

To allow work on the requirements draft to proceed we suggest the following resolution:

a) & b) Should be addressed in the OAM requirements draft.

   The definition of tandem connect should be removed since it is not referenced in this draft.

   AIS/FDI are out of scope for this general requirements draft.

b) When MPLS-TP is used in transport network applications defined by the ITU-T only unidirectional and co-routed bidirectional point-to-point transport paths will be used. Therefore from the perspective of the ITU the requirement for associated bidirectional point-to-point transport paths may be removed. However, if, as indicated during the IETF discussions, associated bidirectional point-to-point transport paths may be used in other applications the requirement can remain as written.

Considering the magnitude of the comments additional work is required on this document. We would like to review the results of this work before supporting approval of this document.
Attach: tp-requirements-06-comments-00.doc