Thank you for providing the MPLS-TP NM requirements (draft-ietf-mpls-tp-nm-req-02.txt) for our review. Before supporting the approval of this draft we would like the changes listed below are implemented.

1. In Section 5.2 third last and second last paragraphs, the terms “failure cause” and “deduced fault” are not defined in the document. Are they supposed to be “fault cause” and “failure” as defined in the terminology section?

2. In Section 7.1, there should be a requirement that the MPLS-TP NE MUST support within the NE the determination of the unavailability of the transport service. The document should also state that unavailability is determined based on SES and UAS, which will be defined in ITU-T recommendations.

Therefore, replace the 4th paragraph of Section 7.1:

For the purposes of this document, it is sufficient to state that an MPLS-TP NE MUST support collection, and reporting, of raw performance data that MAY be used in determining availability of a transport service, and that implementations SHOULD support some as yet to be defined mechanism for determining service availability.

with the following three paragraphs:

The MPLS-TP NE MUST support collection and reporting of raw performance data that MAY be used in determining unavailability of a transport service.

The MPLS-TP NE MUST support the determination of the unavailability of the transport service. This determination MUST be supported within the MPLS-TP NE.
Note that for the Ethernet transport network, unavailability is determined based on Severely Errored Seconds (SES). SES and Unavailable Seconds (UAS) are defined for Ethernet transport networks in ITU-T Recommendation Y.1563 [29]. ITU-T is currently extending these definitions to apply them to the packet transport technology in general. Once these definitions are available, they should be used for the MPLS-TP NE.

Reference [27] G.806 should be a normative reference. It is being normatively cited in the terminology section.

In appendix A point 2 and point 5, DCC is used but there is no reference or definition. So far DCC is a term used in the SDH technology only. We suggest replace DCC here with CCh.

Attached is a marked-up version of the NM Requirement draft with the suggested changes per the comments above and also some editorial fixes.

ATTACHMENT: