2016Q4-Liaison-IETF-L2SMwg

Title	Liaison to IETF on proposed Working Group on L2SM
Date	October 27, 2016
Location	Ottawa, Canada
Contacts	liaisons@mef.net Nan Chen, President MEF (nan@mef.net) Raghu Ranganathan, TOC Co-Chair (rraghu@ciena.com) Shahar Steiff, TOC Co-Chair (ssteiff@pccwglobal.com)
To	statements@ietf.org
Cc	Kevin Vachon, COO MEF (kevin@mef.net)
	Scott Mansfield Mahesh Jethanandani Stephan Pelletier John Strassner
From	MEF Forum

MEF Forum noticed the announcement of a proposed new L2SM Working Group in IETF (https://datatracker.ietf.org/wg/l2sm/charter/). In particular, we see the following in the proposed charter:

- "The model can be used for communication between customers and network operators, and to provide input to automated control and configuration applications."
- "Instead, the L2VPN customer service model contains the characteristics of the service as discussed between the operators and their customers."

We include the following relevant information on MEF published and ongoing work for your consideration - note in particular that MEF is already working on Yang modules for MEF services:

1) MEF Service Model & Attributes (Published Specifications)

- MEF 10.3 Specification (https://www.mef.net/Assets/Technical_Specifications/PDF/MEF_10.3.pdf) describes Ethernet Service attributes for services provided to the Subscriber (end user) by the Service Provider. The Ethernet Services are modeled from the point of view of the Subscriber's equipment referred to as the Customer Edge (CE) that is used to access the service.
  - Note-1: MEF uses 'Subscriber' to refer to user (or Customer) of Ethernet Services
  - Note-2: MEF uses 'CE' to refer to Customer Edge for Equipment on the Subscriber side of UNI (i.e., owned by Subscriber)
- MEF 6.2 Specification (https://www.mef.net/Assets/Technical_Specifications/PDF/MEF_6.2.pdf) focuses on Ethernet Virtual Connection (EVC) based Ethernet Services offered by a Service Provider (SP) to a Subscriber.
- MEF 26.2 Specification (https://www.mef.net/Assets/Technical_Specifications/PDF/MEF_26.2.pdf) provides the models and framework for interconnecting multiple Carrier Ethernet Networks (CENs), and the service attributes for services provided by one Operator to another or to a Service Provider.
- MEF 51 Specification (http://www.mef.net/Assets/Technical_Specifications/PDF/MEF_51.pdf) focuses on Operator Virtual Connection (OVC) based Ethernet Services offered by an Operator where at least one OVC Endpoint is at an ENNI.

2) MEF Service Information Model (Ongoing Project)

- MEF has an ongoing project for MEF Carrier Ethernet Services Management Information Model and has draft approved for final Letter Ballot (i.e., if successful will be published as MEF 7.3 in January 2017).
- The latest Approved Draft version is available at the liaison login link provided below.

© The MEF Forum 2016. Any reproduction of this document, or any portion thereof, shall contain the following statement: 'Reproduced with permission of the MEF Forum.' No user of this document is authorized to modify any of the information contained herein.

3) MEF Lifecycle Service Orchestration Reference Architecture (Published Specification)

- MEF 55 Specification (https://www.mef.net/Assets/Technical_Specifications/PDF/MEF_55.pdf) defines a reference architecture that describes the functional management entities needed to support LSO, and the Management Interface Reference Points between them.
- MEF's work on Service Information & Data Models can be applicable for the following interfaces supported by the Service Orchestration Function (SOF) as shown in Figure 2 of MEF 55 and described in Section 9.3 of MEF 55:
    - ALLEGRO (CUS:SOF): The Management Interface Reference Point that allows Customer Application Coordinator supervision and control of dynamic service behavior (see Section 8.2.3) of the LSO service capabilities under its purview through interactions with the Service Orchestration Functionality.
    - LEGATO (BUS:SOF): The Management Interface Reference Point between the Business Applications and the Service Orchestration Functionality needed to allow management and operations interactions supporting LSO connectivity services.
    - INTERLUDE (SOF:SOF): The Management Interface Reference Point that provides for the coordination of a portion of LSO services within the partner domain that are managed by a Service Provider's Service Orchestration Functionality within the bounds and policies defined for the service.

4) MEF YANG Modules for MEF Services (Ongoing Project)

- Please see our previous Liaison to IETF
    - Jan 2015: https://www.ietf.org/lib/dt/documents/LIAISON/liaison-2015-02-04-mef-the-ietf-liaison-about-new-project-on-yang-modules-for-mef-services-attachment-1.pdf
    - Nov 2015: https://datatracker.ietf.org/liaison/1439/ (includes attachment of the re-scope)
- Draft YANG Modules are currently being updated to address member comments; the latest versions are attached and MEF will share the final versions once they are completed.

Additionally, MEF would like clarification on the proposed charter. For example, the text in charter includes - "The working group will attempt to derive a single data model that includes support for point-to-point Virtual Private Wire Services (VPWS), multipoint Virtual Private LAN services (VPLS) that use Pseudowires signaled using the Label Distribution Protocol (LDP) and the Border Gateway Protocol (BGP) as described in RFC4761 and RFC6624, and Ethernet VPNs specified in RFC 7432." Is the focus of L2SM about the internal network technologies and implementations as opposed to "characteristics of the service as discussed between the operators and their customers"?

Assuming the focus is on the latter, i.e., "characteristics of the service as discussed between the operators and their customers", we would like to suggest that, if the working group is approved, IETF proceeds by augmenting the MEF Yang modules instead of duplicating the work that has already been done in MEF.

MEF looks forward to collaborating with IETF to provide the industry with a single standard Ethernet Service model and related YANG Modules.

MEF's liaison partners may access all MEF approved drafts as follows:

https://mef.net/liaison-login
Username: mef
Password: M3F3030

The MEF meets next in Los Angeles, CA, USA on Jan 23-26, 2016.

Attach: mef-service-yang.tar.gz

© The MEF Forum 2016. Any reproduction of this document, or any portion thereof, shall contain the following statement: 'Reproduced with permission of the MEF Forum.' No user of this document is authorized to modify any of the information contained herein.