

Multicast Router Discovery

draft-ietf-magma-mrdisc-04

Jim Martin (jim@netzwert.ag)

Brian Haberman (brian@innovationslab.net)

Response to IESG

- Discusses and responses in -04
 - Russ Housley
 - Ipsec AH should not be used because it generally doesn't employ a signature mechanism
 - IPSec ESP should be used because it is required by rfc2401bis
 - **RESOLUTION**: Switched the requirement to ESP, potentially with a null encryption method
 - Key selection is unclear in document
 - **RESOLUTION**: Documented that that a symmetric signature authentication algorithm with a manually configured key is to be used

Response to IESG

– Thomas Narten

- Several unclear references to “advertisement”
- **RESOLUTION:** Added “unsolicited” as appropriate throughout document
- NeighborDeadInterval was determined by locally defined variables rather than the advertized Advertisement Interval
- **RESOLUTION:** NeighborDeadInterval is now 3 times the received Advertisement Interval
- The IPv4 checksum does not include an IP layer pseudo-header, but IPv6 does
- **RESOLUTION:** No change, as this is common behavior

Response to IESG

- Thomas Narten (continued)
 - Query Interval Field isn't used or defined
 - **RESOLUTION**: No change. Is explained in the Overview section
 - We define that the IPv4 protocol is set to IGMP, but made no reference to IPv6
 - **RESOLUTION**: Added a ICMPv6 Next Header section
 - Concern that the MaxAdvertisementInterval / MinAdvertisementInterval mechanism can allow too much jitter
 - **RESOLUTION**: No change. If the defaults are accepted, then jitter is 5 seconds max.

Response to IESG

- Bert Wijnen (comments)
 - Missing Citations
 - **RESOLUTION**: Fixed
 - Asks if we have a MIB in development for the management variables
 - **RESOLUTION**: Made no change and ducked :-)
 - Asks for the authors section to be clarified
 - **RESOLUTION**: Comment on Brad and Shantam moved to Acknowledgments

Response to IESG

– Alex Zinin

- Asks for clarification on rate-limiting
- **RESOLUTION**: Added the MaxMessageRate variable, which defines a maximum message rate per interface or logging destination
- Asked for clarification on MinAdvertisementInterval
- **RESOLUTION**: Clarified in the response to Thomas

05 fixes the rest

- Thomas was unhappy with:
 - The lack of change for checksum calculation
 - **RESOLUTION**: We convinced him that our checksum calculation is consistent with IGMP/MLD and other documents
 - The time randomization between periodic advertisements
 - **RESOLUTION**: Changed MaxAdvertisementInterval and MinAdvertisementInterval to AdvertisementInterval and AdvertisementJitter
- Russ and Alex haven't commented on 04