

BIER Meeting Minutes

Exec Summary: OAM, Yang towards adoption, core drafts moving well towards LC, security still missing, discussion whether it should moved into standards track

- Note Well
- Greg: Yang: only points of contention and progress to be reported
 - towards last call, last point of contention scope of flooding of BIER info
 - no questions
- Eckert: BIER-TE:
 - new co-authors
 - FRR: modifying bit mask as local decision and rerouting the packet
 - Mirsky: how do you differentiate between link & node failure ? can't, like RSVP, probably either/or
 - subdomains
 - concerns about applying term of SI to BIER-TE
 - new terminology will be introduced and mappings analyzed
 - suggestion of introduction of slices (single bit with its own label)
 - Andrew/ALU: Is that of any value ? don't make it WG item
 - OAM: we have OAM & that runs over resilient layer and this is violating multi-layer network OAM recommendation
 - Diego ? : in physical topologies possibly valuable ?
 - chairs: please take out to list as "protection for BIER" discussion
 - chairs: split TE from the "protection" discussion and what do we adopt
- Mirsky: Performance Measurement with marking in BIER
 - double marking method more advanced & preferable
 - call for WG adoption
 - rough consensus of readers to adopt
 - call will be taken to the list
 - chairs: delayed question: this does NOT prohibit use of OAM bits in different manner ?
 - unclear: discussion to be taken to the list whether we can imagine other uses of those OAM bits ?
- Mirsky: BFD in BIER
 - part of larger piece of work from the "overlay OAM design team"
 - submitted to RTG WG
- Sandy?: BIER Ethernet Encapsulation
 - call for adoption:
 - Chairs/Eckert: where is the discussion ? what are the use cases ? who will do the work
 - Alia: where are the use-cases, we also have a Wiki ?
 - Andrew: generate more interest
 - chairs: we can't just let it sit or worse, standardize without review.
 - Greg: IEEE is not expensive ;-). Here's a chance to get a 2.5 multicast solution
 - Alia: talk to Pat Tayler
 - Chair: comments been given on list about MAC addresses. This NEEDS review

- Eckerd: Wiki too light ?
 - Alia: yes, f2f let's figure out how we work together. Form the discussion anyway you want
 - David: Where are the DC people with use cases so the claims can be unsubstantiated.
 - Partha/Bloomberg: Sounds interesting
 - David/Mellanox: BML MUST be set on all encapsulations
 - chair: needs more input/discussion/collaboration before we call adoption
- Linda: BIER Use Case in NVO3
 - Greg: is BIER overlay coordinated with NVO overlay ? BIER is a transport for NVO
- Ran: Yang for BIER
 - chair: what's the FRR in BIER ?
 - chair: great it's validated, that's real progress
 - Greg: ?
 - chair: should we call for adoption ? solid consensus for adoption. will be taken to the list
 - chair: FRR needs removed until we have consensus/WG items
- Ran: BGP-LS for BIER
 - has been discussed with Peter, aligns with OSPF
 - weak consensus to call for adoption with no opposition. Will be taken to the list
- Linda?/Path Autogeneration:
 - Chairs: read/comment
- Linda?/BIER TE Yang Model:
 - Chair: Do not explain the model, highlight progress and issues
 - Greg: why not augment the base model ? BIER-TE fwd is very different ? But Yang is `_configuration_` and `_state_`, fwd data plane paradigm is orthogonal to that. Question there are sufficient differences between the models here
 - Eckert/Cisco: ?
 - chair: get a doctor ? no. get a doctor.
- Chair: Should we aim for Standards Track ? What's the Criteria ?
 - chair: we lack security
 - Alia: I need to look @ problem statement to address it further.
 - Documents.
 - being EXPERIMENTAL helped focus and speed
 - implementation status added ? experience how it's used ? applicability ?
 - Robert Raszuk: we can't get silicon vendors to implement because experimental (as Bloomberg input) so it's chicken/egg problem.
 - Alia: but then get me more status/comments on list. It will touch `_everything_` in the hourglass once it becomes PS. So consider this.
 - Robert: we're looking BIER in overlay so we can even software.
 - Alia: so add use-case to document